

## ***Sinister Spirit***

*Tracing the Spirit of Antichrist Through Current Events*

By Timothy Zebell

## **Appendix B.7**

### History of the Charismatic Movement

*\*\*Note: The Pentecostal, Charismatic, and Vineyard denominations belong to the same family tree. They all share a common ancestry and are very similar in their core doctrines. Charles Peter Wagner has defined these as the first, second, and third waves of the Holy Spirit. For the sake of simplicity, I refer to these three as a unit in the body of my book, using the title “Charismatic Movement.” In the appendices, I am choosing, instead, to use the title “Signs and Wonders Movement” due to the included content. Technically, this title usually refers to Peter Wagner’s third wave of the Holy Spirit, but in these appendices, I intend it as a title referring to all three waves of the Holy Spirit.*

**Visit [www.InquisitiveChristianity.com](http://www.InquisitiveChristianity.com) for a flow chart of the following content.**

### Author’s Note

This is a brief overview and study of a movement that includes many sub-categories, offshoots, and denominations. Some refer to this movement as Pentecostal, others Charismatic, Full Gospel, Signs and Wonders, etc. Each of these titles technically refer only to a specific subcategory, or phase, of this movement. Unfortunately, to the best of my knowledge, there exists no recognized title which encompasses all aspects of this movement. The closest we get to such a designation is Peter Wagner’s categorizing this movement as consisting of the three waves of the Holy Spirit. Essentially, he identifies the First Wave of the Holy Spirit as the Pentecostal movement. The Second Wave is the Charismatic movement, and the Third Wave is the Signs and Wonders Movement.

In order to make this study as clear as possible, a title must be attributed to this movement as a whole. To do otherwise would be far too confusing. "Charismatic Movement" is perhaps the most commonly used title. As such, I have chosen to use this title even though, as a title, it technically refers only to the second phase of this movement—the Second Wave of the Holy Spirit. However, there are times when I must refer to this Second Wave of the Holy Spirit. To distinguish it from the general title "charismatic," I will italicize every use of the word "Charismatic" which refers specifically to the Second Wave of the Holy Spirit.

It should also be noted that my division of the first, second, and third waves of the Holy Spirit differ slightly from that of Peter Wagner. The difference is minor, being only a variable of several years as to the duration of each wave.

## Chapter 1

The saga of the Signs and Wonders Movement officially begins with the rise of Montanism in 156 A.D. Montanism was judged to be heretical by the early church and was eventually extinguished. It was only after a gap of more than 1,500 years that it began to be revived. This revival most likely began with the Wesley brothers. John and Charles Wesley were traveling evangelists in England. They initially sought to reform the Anglican Church, but their efforts ultimately produced the Methodist denomination—although it was not officially established until after John Wesley’s death in 1791 A.D. This remains a prominent denomination to this day.

John and Charles Wesley truly desired to honor God. Unfortunately, their church background was doctrinally unsound. Additionally, John Wesley studied Eastern Orthodoxy. Most likely, at some point in these studies, John Wesley exposed himself to the doctrine of Theosis. Theosis is a process in which a man is made to be divine like God—only without God’s divine essence, or His uncausedness. It is a form of deification for man in which man becomes the fullness of the divine image of God.<sup>1</sup> This almost assuredly accounts for some of the doctrinal errors which underpinned the Wesley brothers’ ministry. Chief among these doctrinal errors is John Wesley’s understanding of the nature of sanctification.

John Wesley taught that a person could be truly sanctified sometime between the moment of his justification by faith and his death. This sanctification does not produce sinless perfection, but rather perfection in love. According to John Wesley, this love would cause the person to so deeply desire to please God that he could avoid all willful sin. In essence, the temptation to sin would be removed because of the individual’s deep love for God. The result of this love would be perfection—the transformation of man’s nature into the divine.

This teaching sounds spiritual. It advocates a pursuit of love that will eventually drive out all temptation and sin. It encourages a deeper and more meaningful relationship with God. It teaches us that we can be

---

<sup>1</sup> “Theosis,” *Theopedia*, accessed Mar. 14, 2014, <http://www.theopedia.com/Theosis>.

holy. Surely this is a good thing! However, the Bible does not teach that we will be free within this lifetime from temptation and the desire to sin. Instead, in Romans 7:21-25, the apostle Paul expresses his frustration with continually battling his sinful nature:

*I find then a law, that, when I would do good, evil is present with me. For I delight in the law of God after the inward man: But I see another law in my members, warring against the law of my mind, and bringing me into captivity to the law of sin which is in my members. O wretched man that I am! who shall deliver me from the body of this death? I thank God through Jesus Christ our Lord. So then with the mind I myself serve the law of God; but with the flesh the law of sin.*

The apostle Paul reminds us that although we have a renewed spirit, our spirit still resides within a fallen body. Our spirit and our flesh are continually at war with one another. It is not until our body is renewed that we will be free from the temptation to sin. We ought to see God's love grow in our hearts, but it will not accomplish all that John Wesley promised. Sanctification is a lifelong process, and it is not until we are freed from our fallen bodies that we will ever live truly sanctified lives.

John Wesley was seeking a higher spiritual plane for the Christian. He was seeking a solution which would result in the Christian experiencing a greater holiness and a more powerful feeling. Moreover, he sought a solution that the Christian could manage to attain himself. To accomplish this, he compromised in his understanding of the doctrines of sin and sanctification. It was a minor compromise, but as we continue, we will witness the devastating effects that it has wrought on Christianity.

The Wesley brothers did not develop their theology solely from laboring in their studies of God's Word. They developed their theology by combining the study of God's Word with the study of other religious movements. Clearly, John Wesley was influenced by the Eastern Orthodox teachings about the transformation of man's nature into one of divinity. This is a teaching which is rooted in a works-based salvation. Likewise, the Wesley brothers were influenced by the life of Montanus. In fact, Charles Wesley, regarded Montanists as "real, Scriptural Christians" and Montanus as "one of the best men then upon the earth."<sup>2</sup> Recall that Montanus was denounced by the early church as a heretic, and the teachings and practices of Montanism were rejected by the church as being equivalent to paganism.<sup>3</sup> Montanus himself claimed that his followers were more spiritual than those who had only the "dead letter of Scripture."<sup>4</sup>

Very quickly, the teachings of John Wesley began to morph and grow to fruition. These developments may not have been Wesley's intention, but they were the logical conclusion of his teachings. In the 1830s, the Higher Life Movement began to emerge in England out of John Wesley's doctrine of

---

<sup>2</sup> Charles Wesley, *Journal, III*, 496 and *The Works of Wesley VI*, (New York, 1856) 556, Source: Interactive Bible, "We have the Holy Spirit."

<sup>3</sup> Cairns, *Christianity Through the Centuries*, 381.

<sup>4</sup> MacArthur, "Does God."

sanctification. It was originally rejected by the majority of Methodist churches, even though it was initially promoted by Methodists who were teaching Methodist doctrines. In **1858**, William Boardman published *The Higher Christian Life*. This furthered the teachings of John Wesley and encouraged people to move past their initial conversion experience and to experience a second work of God in their lives. This second work, also called the second blessing, was titled "entire sanctification." Today we often hear it referred to as "being filled with the Holy Spirit."

Gradually, the Methodist churches in London began to accept the Higher Life teachings. Robert Pearsall Smith eventually convinced many churches that they ran the risk of falling behind other churches who had embraced the Higher Life Movement. Not wanting to be spiritually inferior to other churches, they invited teachers to come and teach these doctrines to their congregations.

A Presbyterian minister by the name of Charles Finney connected John Wesley's doctrine of the second work of grace with Spirit baptism. Wesley taught that a believer could receive freedom from willful sins when filled with God's love. This was accomplished when God wrought a second work of grace in a person's life to sanctify him. Charles Finney furthered this idea with the teaching that a person could be baptized by the Holy Spirit. When this occurred, he would be anointed by the Holy Spirit and so powerfully indwelt by Him that he would not sin.

The doctrines of Spirit Baptism and being filled with the Holy Spirit eventually became integral to the theology of the Signs and Wonders Movement. They are the natural conclusion to the teachings of John Wesley and are a combination of the Holiness Movement's doctrines along with those of the Higher Life Movement. This doctrine was greatly influenced by the efforts of Methodists, Anglicans, and Presbyterians along with Armenians and Calvinists alike.

## Chapter 2

The Holiness Movement spawned three movements of special interest to our study. The first is the Higher Life Movement. It was from this movement that John Wesley's second work of grace morphed to become Spirit baptism and "being filled with the Holy Spirit." This doctrine would later become the foundational underpinning of the Pentecostal Movement.

The second movement of interest is the Latter Rain Movement. This movement was primarily ignited and fueled by William Bryant, Richard Spurling, and his son, Richard Spurling Jr. It was a radical Holiness Movement theology which arose among select groups of Baptists and Methodists in North Carolina and Tennessee during the 1880s. Surrounding Baptists quickly derided it, causing it to form its own identity. When some of the congregation members in Richard Spurling Jr.'s Baptist church began speaking in tongues during a revival meeting, he and some 30 congregation members were expelled from the church. They began meeting in the home of William Bryant and formed the Holiness Church in 1892. Eventually, after Ambrose Jessup Tomlinson assumed control over the movement, this church became the Church of God in 1907. Today, the Church of God remains a prominent denomination.

The Latter Rain Movement emphasized holiness through Spirit baptism, speaking in tongues, healings, prophecy, and miracle working. There was an effort to return to the pattern of the early church as seen in the book of Acts. In its early days, the Latter Rain Movement considered itself non-denominational and sought to create a universal church. However, the movement quickly experienced schisms and doctrinal divisions.

It must be remembered that the experiences of the early church in the book of Acts were unique to the founding of the church. It was a transitional time. As such, there were exceptional experiences and circumstances, just as with anything new. Additionally, the Bible was not yet complete. As had been God's pattern throughout Scripture, God's Word was accompanied by signs and wonders as verification. Mark 16:20 says, "*And they went forth, and preached every where, the Lord working with them, and confirming the word with signs following. Amen.*" The purpose of the sign gifts was to verify God's

Word. Once God's Word was complete, there was no longer any need for signs and wonders. To desire to return to the pattern of the early church and anticipate signs and wonders from God is to desire to return to a time when God's revelation was incomplete and His church was a spiritual infant. It is as if a grown man desired to once again be treated as a toddler who is dependent upon others to take care of him.

The Latter Rain Movement also mistakenly believed that they were living in the last days and were receiving the fulfillment of Joel 2:23-29.<sup>5</sup> They believed that God's spirit was raining down on mankind along with His blessings. However, the prophecy in Joel is not a prophecy for the church. It is a prophecy for the Jewish nation. Additionally, it is a prophecy which will not be fulfilled until after Christ returns to earth and establishes His millennial kingdom. It is not possible for the church to be experiencing the prophecy of Joel 2.

This movement combined with various revivals, such as the Azusa Street Revival, were together considered to be the Outpouring of the Latter Rain Movement. It was this, together with the Pentecostal Movement, which formed the Assemblies of God church. However, we must first back up and examine the precursors of the Pentecostal Movement.

The third and most significant offshoot of the Holiness Movement is the Pentecostal Movement, also known as the First Wave. Its inception can be traced back to Edward Irving who was influenced not only by the Holiness Movement, but also by the philosophy of Coleridge. His interest in Coleridge centered largely around the mystical and obscure. Irving is also known for his heretical doctrine regarding the incarnation of Jesus Christ. He taught that Jesus' body was sinful flesh. He maintained that Jesus Himself never sinned, but this was not due to His being The Holy God. Instead, Jesus was kept from sinning by the empowering work of the Holy Spirit in His life.

In London, Edward Irving believed the Spirit of God fell upon his Church of Scotland congregation, beginning with Mary Campbell and James and Margaret MacDonald. Soon afterward, he formed the Holy Catholic Apostolic Church which emphasized the gifts of the Holy Spirit. It was Catholic in its use of incense, vestments, and creeds which were based upon Roman Catholic, Orthodox, and Anglican rites. It

---

<sup>5</sup> Joel 2:23-29: "Be glad, O children of Zion, and rejoice in the LORD your God, for he has given the early rain for your vindication; he has poured down for you abundant rain, the early and the latter rain, as before. "The threshing floors shall be full of grain; the vats shall overflow with wine and oil. I will restore to you the years that the swarming locust has eaten, the hopper, the destroyer, and the cutter, my great army, which I sent among you. "You shall eat in plenty and be satisfied, and praise the name of the LORD your God, who has dealt wondrously with you. And my people shall never again be put to shame. You shall know that I am in the midst of Israel, and that I am the LORD your God and there is none else. And my people shall never again be put to shame. "And it shall come to pass afterward, that I will pour out my Spirit on all flesh; your sons and your daughters shall prophesy, your old men shall dream dreams, and your young men shall see visions. Even on the male and female servants in those days I will pour out my Spirit.

was Apostolic in its promotion of tongues and in the active roles assigned to deacons, elders, prophets, and apostles in its ministries and polity.

Intrigued by reports of people speaking in tongues and of healings near Glasgow, Edward Irving led his congregation in fervent prayer that they too might receive the spiritual gifts—especially the gift of tongues. He himself never received the gift of tongues, but his congregation did in July of **1831**. Originally, Irving restrained the use of tongues and interpretations during his services. He refused to allow his sermons to be interrupted by these practices. However, it soon became an impossible feat. It was illogical to preach that a person speaking in tongues was sharing a prophecy or instruction from God and yet refuse to allow that person to speak. If the Lord had a word of prophecy for His people during Irving's sermon, who was he to stand in the way of the Lord? He must freely allow people to speak the Word of God when it came to them.

Irving's church was known for its wild excesses. Prophets in his church often contradicted each other and presented prophecies that were never fulfilled. Those possessing the gift of tongues began to find it hard to follow a pastor who himself was not spiritual enough to receive such a gift. Eventually, some arose and claimed to possess the gift of being apostles. They ultimately usurped control over the church in the name of the Holy Spirit.

Edward Irving was a chief proponent of the doctrine of tongues. Additionally, he exerted great influence over two key men—John Alexander Dowie and Charles Parham. Dowie is considered the father of healing evangelism, and Charles Parham is considered the father of Pentecostalism. Although they did not agree with one another's doctrine, Charles Parham was greatly impacted by the ministry of Dowie.

Charles Parham married the daughter of a Quaker and spent a period of time traveling and observing various movements and ministries. Two of these ministries had particular significance in the formation of Parham's theology. The first was that of John Alexander Dowie who emphasized the Holy Spirit's continuing use of miracles and healings in the church today. The second was Frank Sandford's mystical cult at Shiloh.

Upon returning from a sabbatical, Charles Parham founded Topeka Bible College in Topeka, Kansas. In December of **1900**, Parham commissioned his students to study the book of Acts and determine what was the original evidence of the early church's receiving the Holy Spirit. They did so and spent several days studying and praying together. On January **1, 1901**, a student by the name of Agnes Ozman asked for prayer that she might receive the empowering of the Holy Spirit. Immediately after they prayed for her, she began speaking in tongues. It was believed that she was speaking Mandarin Chinese. For three days, she claimed that she was unable to speak or write in anything other than Mandarin.

It was not long before other students began claiming the gift of tongues. Parham himself believed that he had received the gift. Soon he began teaching that anyone who receives the empowering and indwelling of the Holy Spirit will always evidence it by speaking in tongues. However, it should be clarified that Parham believed the gift of tongues was always the ability to speak a known language that was not known to the speaker. Tongues were never mere utterances and gibberish but always a spoken language. He even began laying hands on those called to missions. He believed that he was empowered to give them the gift of tongues so that they could go onto the mission field without any language school. Many were sent to foreign countries in faith, believing that the words they were speaking were an actual language only to discover that it was nothing more than gibberish.

Agnes Ozman was credited as the first person in America to speak in tongues. This is not correct. Cults such as the Shakers had been speaking in tongues long before Agnes Ozman. Nevertheless, history often remembers Agnes Ozman as the first person to speak in tongues in America.

Another student of Charles Parham, William Seymour, became instrumental in the formation of the Pentecostal Movement. He learned the doctrine of tongues while attending Parham's school and eventually ministered together with Parham. William Seymour ultimately moved to Los Angeles, California to pastor a church which had been formerly pastored by a woman but no longer had a pastor. In his first sermon, he preached the doctrine of tongues and was run out of the church. Consequently, he started a new church in an abandoned warehouse on Azusa Street.

Those who attended Seymour's church on Azusa Street received any number of spiritual gifts. Word spread that revival was occurring in Seymour's church. People came from all across the country to experience the Azusa Street Revival. Charles Parham also came to witness it, but he was appalled by what he saw. In his first message, he preached that God was "sick at His stomach" because of what was transpiring on Azusa Street. The tongues were not Biblical tongues. Instead, he claimed they were nothing more than "chattering, jabbering and sputtering, speaking no language at all."<sup>6</sup> Worse still, the Azusa Street meetings were largely characterized by manifestations of the flesh, spiritualistic controls, and the practice of hypnotism.

In his writings about Azusa Street, Parham described men and women falling on one another in a morally compromising manner. The people were led by emotionalism and exercised no self-control. Charles Parham always preached that a person was to be in control of himself and not governed by emotion. Appalled by what he witnessed, it was he who coined the term "holy roller" based upon his observations at Azusa Street.

---

<sup>6</sup> Cloud, "The Strange Early History of Pentecostalism."

Nevertheless, William Seymour refused to change any of the practices. He even refused to prohibit séances and Occult trances. Instead, he expelled Charles Parham from the Azusa Street meetings. Parham spent the rest of his days decrying the Azusa Street Revival as being devilish and not of God. Interestingly enough, nearly every Pentecostal, Charismatic, and Signs and Wonders church can trace their lineage directly to the Azusa Street Revival. It is ironic that Charles Parham, known as the father of Pentecostalism, decried the revival which officially began the Pentecostal Movement as being devilish and not of God. Further, Parham was the one who established the core doctrine of all Pentecostal churches—that the anointing of the Holy Spirit will always be evidenced by speaking in tongues. However, Parham claimed that the only acceptable practice of speaking in tongues is to speak a known language—never gibberish. Most Pentecostal churches today claim gibberish as the true gift of tongues.

The Azusa Street Revival lasted from **1906** until **1913**. It became the event which officially began the Pentecostal Movement, also known as the First Wave of the Holy Spirit. This movement lasted from **1906** to **1960**. In **1914**, the Assemblies of God church was established. It was the product of the Pentecostal Movement in combination with the Outpouring of the Latter Day Rain Movement. Today the Assemblies of God remains a prominent denomination.

Thus we see that the three movements which were fueled by the Holiness Movement eventually merged together in the Assemblies of God denomination. The Higher Life Movement's primary contribution was the development of Wesley's second work of grace to become Spirit baptism. The Latter Rain Movement, which eventually morphed into the Outpouring of the Latter Rain Movement, contributed a rejection of doctrinal distinctions between churches. Additionally, it emphasized the idea that churches today ought to follow the pattern of the early Church in the book of Acts. Finally, the Pentecostal Movement developed the doctrine of tongues until it became required evidence of the empowerment and indwelling of the Holy Spirit. According to this doctrine, a believer does not necessarily receive the Holy Spirit at the time of his conversion. Instead, through prayerful request and faith, a believer will receive the Holy Spirit at a subsequent time, and the reception of the Holy Spirit will always be accompanied by the gift of tongues.

## Chapter 3

Pentecostalism quickly divided into two branches. The division was caused by a controversy over the Trinity of God. In 1913, R.E. McAlister spoke at the World-Wide Apostolic Camp Meeting which was held in Arroyo Seco, California and conducted by Maria Woodworth-Etter. It had advertised the promise of unity and a power which had not yet been known, but it resulted in serious division among the Pentecostals. While preaching about water baptism, McAlister claimed that the apostles had baptized with a single immersion using a single name—Jesus Christ. He argued that the words “Father, Son, and Holy Ghost” were never used by the apostles but were added sometime later in church history.

Before continuing, it is worthwhile to remember Jesus’ final command to His disciples before ascending into heaven. These are the same individuals who became the apostles to whom McAlister is referring. Jesus commanded in Matthew 28:19, *“Go ye therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost:”* As faithful followers of Christ’s command, the apostles would certainly have baptized believers in the name of all three Persons of the Trinity.

John Schaepe was greatly touched by McAlister’s sermon on baptism. He stayed up through the night reading his Bible and praying. The next morning, he ran through the camp proclaiming that he had received a revelation from God about baptism. The name of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit is truly “the Lord Jesus Christ.” This officially sparked the Oneness controversy and began the Oneness Movement.

It was not the baptismal method which provoked controversy. Rather, at issue was McAlister and others’ rejection of the Trinity of God. They taught that God was not three Persons yet one God. Instead, they taught that God had three roles or offices, just as a man can be a father to someone, a son of someone, and a husband all at once. He is not three separate persons, He simply has three separate roles or offices.

Scripture supports the doctrine of the Trinity. This is made clear in passages such as Matthew 28:19, *“Go ye therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of*

*the Holy Ghost:*” Scripture is filled with accounts which clearly depict distinct Persons of God rather than God simply functioning according to a particular role. An example of this is Revelation chapter 5 where Jesus, looking like a lamb that was slain, approaches God the Father who sits upon the throne. Before His throne is the Holy Spirit who is referred to as the seven spirits of God (Isaiah 11:1-2<sup>7</sup>). These three Persons of the Godhead are necessarily distinct from one another, and yet careful analysis of the text reveals that they are also One. Likewise, in Judges, God the Father and the Son together communicate to Gideon. In Judges 6:21-23,<sup>8</sup> we read that the Son—referred to as “the Angel of the Lord”<sup>9</sup>—leaves, but the Father remains to speak with Gideon. Furthermore, when Jesus was baptized in Matthew 3:16-17,<sup>10</sup> the Holy Spirit descended in the form of a dove and rested on Jesus while the voice of the Father boomed down from heaven. Many times Jesus claimed a distinction between himself and the other persons of the Trinity, such as John 8:28, and 38,<sup>11</sup> John 12:49-50,<sup>12</sup> and John 16:13.<sup>13</sup> In John 14:10, Jesus clarifies that He and the Father are distinct Persons and yet are One God, “*Believest thou not that I am in the Father, and the Father in me? the words that I speak unto you I speak not of myself: but the Father that dwelleth in me, he doeth the works.*”

---

<sup>7</sup> Isaiah 11:1-2: There shall come forth a shoot from the stump of Jesse, and a branch from his roots shall bear fruit. And the Spirit of the LORD shall rest upon him, the Spirit of wisdom and understanding, the Spirit of counsel and might, the Spirit of knowledge and the fear of the LORD.

<sup>8</sup> Judges 6:21-23: Then the angel of the LORD reached out the tip of the staff that was in his hand and touched the meat and the unleavened cakes. And fire sprang up from the rock and consumed the meat and the unleavened cakes. And the angel of the LORD vanished from his sight. Then Gideon perceived that he was the angel of the LORD. And Gideon said, “Alas, O Lord GOD! For now I have seen the angel of the LORD face to face.” But the LORD said to him, “Peace be to you. Do not fear; you shall not die.”

<sup>9</sup> The Angel of the Lord is a pre-incarnate title of Jesus Christ in Scripture. We can be certain that He is Jesus Christ because the Apostle John declares that nobody has seen God the Father at any time. He teaches that anytime a person witnessed God, it was actually Jesus Christ revealing God the Father. John 1:18 says, “*No one has ever seen God; the only God, who is at the Father’s side, he has made him known.*” Therefore, when we read in the Old Testament about people who saw the Angel of the Lord and declared Him to be God, we must be reading about Jesus Christ:

- Judges 13:21-22: The angel of the LORD appeared no more to Manoah and to his wife. Then Manoah knew that he was the angel of the LORD. And Manoah said to his wife, “We shall surely die, for we have seen God.”
- Genesis 16:7, 13: The angel of the LORD found her by a spring of water in the wilderness, the spring on the way to Shur. ... So she called the name of the LORD who spoke to her, “You are a God of seeing,” for she said, “Truly here I have seen him who looks after me.”

<sup>10</sup> Matthew 3:16-17: And when Jesus was baptized, immediately he went up from the water, and behold, the heavens were opened to him, and he saw the Spirit of God descending like a dove and coming to rest on him; and behold, a voice from heaven said, “This is my beloved Son, with whom I am well pleased.”

<sup>11</sup> John 8:28, 38: So Jesus said to them, “When you have lifted up the Son of Man, then you will know that I am he, and that I do nothing on my own authority, but speak just as the Father taught me...I speak of what I have seen with my Father, and you do what you have heard from your father.”

<sup>12</sup> John 12:49-50: For I have not spoken on my own authority, but the Father who sent me has himself given me a commandment—what to say and what to speak. And I know that his commandment is eternal life. What I say, therefore, I say as the Father has told me.”

<sup>13</sup> John 16:13: When the Spirit of truth comes, he will guide you into all the truth, for he will not speak on his own authority, but whatever he hears he will speak, and he will declare to you the things that are to come.

Fearing that this Oneness doctrine might overtake their church, the Fourth General Council of the Assemblies of God met in October, 1916 to formulate a clear doctrinal statement affirming the Trinity of God. This provoked about a quarter of the ministers within the Assemblies of God denomination to withdraw and form their own denominations and organizations.

A number of Oneness groups merged together in 1917 to form the General Assembly of the Apostolic Assemblies in Eureka Springs. In 1918, it merged with the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World which had been formed in 1916. However, divisions arose over such issues as the role of women in ministry, the use of wine versus grape juice in communion, divorce and remarriage, and the proper mode of water baptism. Added to this was racial tension as numerous African-Americans were joining the organization. One of these was Garfield T. Haywood who was the Secretary General of the organization and responsible to sign all ministerial credentials. To prevent having a black man sign a white minister's credentials, resolutions were proposed which would require that all credentials be signed by people of the same race. These, combined with segregation laws led to a split within the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World.

The 1924 split was largely along racial lines. In 1925, three new organizations were formed: The Apostolic Churches of Jesus Christ, Emmanuel's Church in Jesus Christ, and the Pentecostal Ministerial Alliance. Later, the first two merged to become the Apostolic Church of Jesus Christ.

Two predominantly white Oneness groups merged in 1945 to become the United Pentecostal Church. These were the Pentecostal Church Incorporated, and the Pentecostal Assemblies of Jesus Christ. In 1972, they added the word "international" and became the United Pentecostal Church International. They too have suffered many schisms and divisions, but they remain today as the largest organization within the Oneness Movement.

## Chapter 4

Demos Shakarian is largely responsible for the rise of the Charismatic Movement. Originally from an independent Pentecostal church, Shakarian cared little about doctrinal distinctions. This was evidenced in his relationship with William Branham and Oral Roberts.

William Branham was an aggressive Oneness proponent who ultimately sparked the Latter Rain Revival in 1948. Likewise, Oral Roberts belonged to the Oneness camp. Even though Demos Shakarian himself believed in the Trinity, he chose to use Oral Roberts as his right-hand man in building up his Full Gospel Business Men's Association. Most likely this was because of Oral Robert's unique access into the Evangelical community.

Billy Graham initiated a relationship with Oral Roberts which propelled Roberts into the Evangelical community. Because of Billy Graham's endorsement, Roberts was given opportunity to pray before the World Congress of Evangelicals and to interact with many influential leaders. His apparent humility, combined with Billy Graham's backing, quickly won over the confidence of many Evangelicals who would have otherwise rejected Robert's Pentecostal doctrine. In many ways, it was Oral Roberts who opened the door of Pentecostalism to the Evangelical mainstream denominations. His ecumenical efforts and compromises combined with Demos Shakarian's Full Gospel Business Men's Association paved the way for the Charismatic Movement.

In 1952, Demos Shakarian established the Full Gospel Business Men's Association for the purpose of spreading Pentecostalism. Businessmen were encouraged to become involved in the community and in various non-Pentecostal denominations. They were to covertly spread their Pentecostal doctrines among the congregation until there was a sufficient number who agreed with them. At that point, they would begin to apply pressure against the leadership of the church. By doing this, many churches embraced Pentecostal doctrines without officially changing their denominational status.

Many compromises were made in this union of Pentecostalism with the Evangelicals. It seemed as though nearly every doctrine was negotiable provided the core doctrines of sign gifts and Spirit baptism remained. Even so, the doctrine that Spirit baptism is always evidenced by speaking in tongues was eventually altered. The revised doctrine maintains that Spirit baptism is usually evidenced by speaking in tongues.

The merging of Pentecostalism with Evangelical doctrines created a hybrid. No longer was it truly Pentecostal, neither was it truly Evangelical. Consequently, it acquired the title "Charismatic." This is a broad title which encompasses all churches who share the common doctrine of Spirit baptism. It can be well argued that some of these churches do not even share the same gospel message, but if they share the doctrine of Spirit baptism, they are welcomed into the Charismatic community.

## Chapter 5

A monumental factor in the Charismatic Movement was the New Order of the Latter Rain. This was a movement established in 1952 which was formed largely through the efforts of A. Earl Lee, George Hawtin, Ern Hawtin, and many others. These men were inspired by the teachings of William Branham. For this reason, Branham is often credited as founding the movement, though this is not technically correct.

The New Order of the Latter Rain Movement was a response to the concern that Pentecostalism had become spiritually dry and was in danger of giving way to formalism. They emphasized what is called the five-fold ministry of the church. This teaches that God continues to give today's church apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors, and teachers. It was their belief that God was again restoring the offices of apostle and prophet to select individuals within His church.

They brought new focus on the spiritual elements of Christianity—especially personal prophesy. Also, their eschatology shifted away from dispensationalism. Most significant was their belief in Joel's Army or the Manifest Sons of God. This teaches that some within the church will eventually come to their full stature in Christ. These individuals will become the manifest sons of God and will receive an unlimited portion of Christ's Spirit. As such, they will be all that Christ was. They will have the power to perform miracles, heal the sick, speak in any language through the power of the Holy Spirit, and even teleport themselves. According to this teaching, it will be these manifest sons of God who will conquer the world and complete God's work by restoring man to his rightful position as mandated before the fall. It will be they who usher in the millennial kingdom of Christ.

Another key difference between the New Order of the Latter Rain and most Pentecostals is their understanding of the spiritual gifts. Most Pentecostals believe that long periods of waiting and praying are often necessary before a person can receive spiritual gifts. The New Order believes that they can impart gifts to others by the laying on of hands. This removes the need to wait and pray for spiritual gifts.

Initially, the bulk of criticism against this movement came from within Pentecostalism. Today many Fundamentalists also criticize the movement. The New Order of the Latter Rain Movement is a name in disrepute. Consequently, most try to disassociate themselves from the New Order. Many deny any involvement while others stress that they never had an official relationship. Nevertheless, the New Order of the Latter Rain had an untold effect on the rise of the Charismatic movement. Nobody can be sure to what extent Charismatic doctrines were affected by the New Order, but it is reasonable to believe that nearly all Charismatic theology was affected in part.

William Branham bridged the gap between the New Order theology and Pentecostalism. One way in which this was accomplished was through his involvement with Demos Shakarian and the Full Gospel Business Men's Association. The Charismatic Movement which arose lasted from 1960 until 1982 and is also known as the Second Wave. Ultimately, the Charismatic Movement was a uniting of some Pentecostal doctrines, some New Order doctrines, and some Evangelical doctrines. It was a form of ecumenicalism.

## Chapter 6

Dennis Bennett officially launched the Charismatic Movement on April 3, 1960 in Van Nuys, California. He was a priest in St. Mark's Episcopal Church who announced that he had received the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Rather than subject his church to the ensuing media frenzy, he resigned the church and relocated to Seattle, Washington. There he ministered in St. Luke's Episcopal Church.

Dennis Bennett's revelation officially established the Pentecostal foothold within mainstream denominations. It wasn't long before other churches followed, and soon Pentecostal doctrines had officially permeated numerous churches in several denominations.

Just as Oral Roberts and Demos Shakarian paved the way for the Charismatic Movement and influenced key leaders within the Evangelical community, so also Kathryn Kuhlman influenced key leaders within the Roman Catholic community. Kathryn always preferred to have her stage filled with Catholic priests, and she was even granted a private audience with the Pope. It was in the wake of Kathryn's ecumenicalism and her influence on Catholic clergy members that the Catholic Charismatic Renewal commenced in 1966 at Duquesne University.

Patti Gallagher began the events of Duquesne Weekend when she came into the second floor chapel. She had already been exposed to the doctrine of Spirit baptism through an "interdenominational charismatic prayer meeting" in the home of Miss Flow Dodge—a Spirit-filled Presbyterian. Intrigued by this new doctrine and eager to experience a miracle, Patti entered the chapel. She did not enter to pray, but rather to encourage those present to come downstairs and participate in a birthday party. According to her testimony, "Yet, when I entered and knelt in the presence of Jesus in the Blessed Sacrament, I literally trembled with a sense of awe before His majesty. I knew in an overwhelming way that He is the King of Kings, the Lord of Lords. I thought, 'You had better get out of here quick before something happens to you.'" Patti quickly found herself laying prostrate before the tabernacle. She claims that her shoes had been removed—though she herself had not touched them. She later brought two students to the chapel and prayed, "Lord, whatever you just did for me, do it for them!" Soon other students came into the

chapel. They too received the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Soon others joined them and experienced sensations of burning in their hands, laughter, tears, and the gift of tongues.<sup>14</sup>

It was not long before other students sought the same emotional experience. They turned to Pentecostal literature and quickly embraced its teachings about Spirit baptism and gifts. Soon the phenomena had spread to many other college campuses; however, the Roman Catholic Church hierarchy refused to condemn the practices. Thus, Pentecostalism officially merged with Roman Catholicism.

The Charismatic Movement of **1960-1982** was the culmination of many efforts. Oral Roberts, through the assistance of Billy Graham, opened the door of Pentecostalism to the Evangelical community. Roberts also helped Demos Shakarian to establish the Full Gospel Business Men's Association. It is through this association that many inroads were made within mainstream denominations. It was also through the efforts of this association that many compromises were accepted for the sake of spreading the doctrines of Spirit baptism and gifts. Ultimately, Oral Roberts and Demos Shakarian's efforts came to their fruition when Dennis Bennett publicly embraced the doctrines of Spirit baptism and gifts in his Episcopal church. This event, combined with the later events of the Duquesne Weekend, began the fastest growing movement in history.

---

<sup>14</sup> Gallagher-Mansfield, Patti, "The Duquesne Weekend."

## Chapter 7

Doctrinal compromise defines the Charismatic movement. It seems as though any doctrine or even gospel message is acceptable provided that Spirit baptism and the practice of sign gifts remain. After all, how can any claim another individual or church is wrong in their teachings and doctrines if the Holy Spirit is anointing them? Experience replaced the Bible as the chief standard of truth. As such, any number of aberrant doctrines and blasphemous heresies arose.

The most notable byproduct of the Charismatic Movement was the Word of Faith Movement. Kenneth Hagin is credited as the father of the movement. In short, it teaches that Christians have been granted God's creative power. If they speak words filled with faith, their speech will manifest itself. This includes creating money, healing illness, securing a good job, blessing another individual, and pretty much anything that one might speak. Individuals create their circumstances by their speech—positive as well as negative.

Although Kenneth Hagin is given credit for founding the Word of Faith movement, credit truly belongs to William Essek Kenyon. It was he who first formulated the doctrines of the Word of Faith Movement. Kenneth Hagin merely plagiarized nearly all of his doctrine from Kenyon.

William Essek Kenyon was not a Christian. He was greatly influenced by such cults as Christian Science, New Thought Metaphysics, Science of the Mind, and Unity School of Christianity. Do not let the term "Christian Science" fool you. There is nothing truly Christian regarding this cult. It teaches that all things are truly good and are spiritual in nature. It denies evil and the physical nature of all things. Our perception of reality and evil are merely an illusion. Further, it denies the substitutionary atonement of Jesus.

William Essek Kenyon himself denied Christ's atoning action on the cross. His theology was rooted in Eastern Mysticism and was transplanted into the Charismatic church via Kenneth Hagin. The Word of Faith Movement has spawned numerous leaders. Consistent among these leaders is a poor testimony, a disregard for Scripture, and blasphemy. It is not uncommon to hear them claim that we are little gods or

that we have the authority to command God to do our bidding. Several of them have been proven or convicted of fraud and financial scams. Some notable names who have been accused of this include Benny Hinn, Charles Capps, Kenneth Copeland, Marilyn Hickey, Jimmy Swaggert, Robert Tilton, A. A. Allen, Frederick Price, Oral Roberts, Creflo Dollar, and David Yongi Cho.

Another key influence on the Word of Faith Movement comes from Kathryn Kuhlman. However, to understand her involvement, we must first begin with Aimee Semple McPherson. Aimee was an evangelist who came out of the Assemblies of God church. Her first husband, Robert Semple, died while they were ministering in China. She returned to the United States and married Harold McPherson. After traveling the country as an evangelist, Aimee settled down in Los Angeles, California where she built the Angelus Temple which eventually became the International Church of the Foursquare Gospel. This remains a prominent denomination today.

Aimee is a controversial figure. She is especially remembered for faking her own death and eventually kidnapping, though she never admitted to this. It is believed that she staged her own death to carry on an illicit affair with a married man and later faked a kidnapping to acquire money. She remained a controversial figure all the way until her death in 1944 when she overdosed on sedatives.

Kathryn Kuhlman mimicked the ministry of Aimee Semple McPherson. Aimee was clearly Kuhlman's greatest influence, and like Aimee, she too led a controversial life. Kathryn Kuhlman was also involved in an affair with a married man while she herself was married. The two eventually divorced their spouses so they could marry. After eight years, they too divorced. However, what Kathryn is most remembered for is her healing ministry and her television program *I Believe in Miracles*.

It was Kathryn Kuhlman who introduced the laying of hands on a person to impart the Holy Spirit. Being slain in the Spirit was common practice among the Pentecostals, but Kathryn added the dimension of laying hands on a person and watching them fall over having been slain in the Spirit.

Word of Faith leader, Benny Hinn, claims to have received his anointing of the Holy Spirit from the dead body of Aimee Semple McPherson. He also claims that, in a vision, Kathryn Kuhlman led him to a room to meet Jesus and receive His empowering. Benny Hinn frequently visits the graves of Aimee and Kathryn.

Just as Kathryn Kuhlman modeled her ministry after that of Aimee Semple McPherson, so also Benny Hinn models his ministry after Kathryn Kuhlman. He conducts his healing meetings in the same manner as Kathryn conducted her meetings. It is not uncommon to see Benny Hinn slaying entire crowds in the Spirit. He has gone one step further than Kathryn in that he purports to impart the Holy Spirit by blowing on people, hitting them with his jacket, or merely waving in their direction.

It seems that when one approach works for a Word of Faith leader, the others quickly mimic it. Consequently, the practices of Benny Hinn can be witnessed in varying forms among the others. The Word of Faith Movement clearly has as its primary influences, William Essek Kenyon, Kenneth Hagin, Aimee Semple McPherson, and Kathryn Kuhlman.

## Chapter 8

Charles Peter Wagner distinguished the various workings of the Holy Spirit in his 1988 book, *The Third Wave of the Holy Spirit: Encountering the Power of Signs and Wonders Today*. This was an attempt to identify and distinguish the contemporary power evangelism phenomenon. According to Wagner, the First Wave of the Holy Spirit occurred during the Azusa Street Revival in 1906 which resulted in the modern Pentecostal denomination. The key feature of this First Wave was the two-tiered view of spirituality which taught a second work of grace—or baptism of the Holy Spirit—subsequent to a person's conversion. This Spirit baptism is always evidenced by speaking in tongues.

The Second Wave of the Holy Spirit began with Dennis Bennett's Spirit Baptism in 1960. It included such groups as the Jesus People Movement which was popular among the Hippies. For all practical purposes, it maintained the core Pentecostal doctrines, but Charismatics often organized into small groups within mainstream denominations rather than form a separate denomination.

The Third Wave of the Holy Spirit began in 1982 with John Wimber's church, The Vineyard. Like the Pentecostals and Charismatics, it emphasizes the manifestation of spiritual gifts. Nevertheless, the Third Wave rejects the doctrine of Spirit baptism. This combined with a revival of Latter Rain theology has produced a movement which resembles the Pentecostal practices but is not fully Pentecostal or Charismatic.

Those who identify themselves as participants in the Third Wave generally wish to be distinguished from Charismatics and Pentecostals. This is partly due to the belief that they are experiencing a separate and fresh outpouring of the Holy Spirit. Partly, this is an effort to separate themselves from the history, scandals, and divisions inherent in the Charismatic and Pentecostal Movements. Mostly, this is due to some key doctrinal deviations from the Charismatic and Pentecostal theology. Most notable among these deviations is the rejection of a second work of grace in the life of a believer. In practice, the Third Wave has revived some of the Latter Rain theology.

John Wimber was undoubtedly the most prominent name within the Third Wave Movement. This movement is sometimes called the Signs and Wonders Movement, Power Evangelism, or the Vineyard Movement. In 1982, Wimber changed the name of His church in Yorba Linda, California from Calvary Chapel to The Vineyard. It soon moved to Anaheim and quickly became the leading church in the Association of Vineyard Churches denomination.

In 1990, John Wimber came to the rescue of Mike Bickle's Kansas City Fellowship. It was a church most known for a group of men commonly referred to as the Kansas City Prophets. Bob Jones (not the Bob Jones who founded Bob Jones University) and Paul Cain were chief among them. These prophets believed that they were receiving direct revelation from God for the corporate church. They were strong proponents of select Latter Rain theology, such as the Manifest Sons of God or the New Breed. They even went so far as to claim that God had preserved the best seed from such bloodlines as that of David, Paul, Peter, James, and John. From this seed would come 35 super-apostles who would subdue the kingdoms of the world and usher in the second coming of Christ.

The Kansas City Prophets are probably most remembered for Bob Jones' word from the Lord revealing that God would not always give His prophets accurate prophecies. He claimed that two thirds of the prophecies would be true, and one third would be false. According to Bob Jones, even false prophecies scare the enemy. He claimed that God has chosen to operate in this manner to prevent the prophets from becoming proud.<sup>15</sup>

In January 1990, Ernie Gruen, a Charismatic pastor of the Full Faith Church of Love in Kansas City, released a 233 page document against the Kansas City Prophets. It listed their erroneous prophecies, statements, and doctrines. He accused the Kansas City Fellowship of sending out false prophets, prophesying that local churches should close down and join the Kansas City Fellowship, and of outright lying.

Mike Bickle and Ernie Gruen were set to resolve their differences at a meeting of the Network of Christian Ministries in July, 1990. But, in May, John Wimber interjected himself into the conflict and offered himself and the Vineyard Movement as a covering for the Kansas City Fellowship and their prophets. His church assumed control over the investigation into the Kansas City Fellowship. Some minor changes were made, but the Kansas City Fellowship was virtually exonerated of all wrong-doings. Instead, The Association of Vineyard Churches incorporated the Kansas City Fellowship into their denomination. It became the Metro Vineyard Fellowship in 1989.

Mike Bickle later admitted to *Charisma* magazine four lessons that he learned from this experience:<sup>16</sup>

1. "We had an elite spirit. That's become more and more real to me--it's so repulsive."
2. "We promoted mystical experience in a disproportionate way, and it was disastrous."
3. "We were careless in the way we communicated prophetic words. This was hurtful in a lot of cases."
4. "We were wrong in the way we promoted the city church concept. I still believe in it, but now I believe it's a unity based on friendship."

A list was released of errors which had been discovered and were being corrected. Nonetheless, the interviews and prophecies of the Kansas City Prophets continued to be made available through the Vineyard catalogue. It was only in 1991—after Bob Jones confessed to a moral failing—that the tapes of the particular prophet Bob Jones were removed from the Vineyard catalogue. Nevertheless, Bob Jones is still recognized as an important prophet among those associated with the Toronto Blessing.

The Toronto Blessing was the result of pastors John and Carol Arnott's work in the Toronto Airport Christian Fellowship. Inspired by revivals in Argentina and South Africa, they invited Randy Clark to come preach at their church. Clark had been greatly influenced by Rodney Howard-Browne who was the earliest known proponent of the Laughter Movement.

Randy Clark came to Toronto and shared the practices of Rodney Howard-Browne with the congregation. On January 10, 1994, revival began. Today it is often called the Toronto Blessing or the Laughing Revival because of the uncontrolled laughter which accompanied the presence of the Holy Spirit. John Arnott is also remembered for becoming drunk with the Holy Spirit. This drunkenness made him appear and behave no differently than if he were drunk with alcohol.

Those within the Third Wave believe bizarre behaviors are ordinary phenomenon which accompany genuine revival. Weeping, laughing, extreme terror, falling, and becoming drunk in the Spirit are common phenomenon accompanying revival. Often associated with this doctrine is a rejection of all reason. It is argued that the mind is carnal, and God is spiritual. Thus, God's operations, being spiritual and not carnal, will appear illogical to the mind.

Eventually, the Toronto Airport Christian Fellowship was removed from The Association of Vineyard Churches because of failure to be in line with what John Wimber saw as the focus of his ministry and for failing to recognize his authority. Nevertheless, John Wimber has reiterated his belief that the Holy

---

<sup>16</sup> "The Kansas City Prophets."

Laughter Movement is a move from God. (It is interesting that it is a move from God and yet it is not in line with what he believes to be the focus of his ministry.)

The Third Wave is distinct from the Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements. Nevertheless, it is the product of Pentecostal and Charismatic theology. As such, it too belongs to the Signs and Wonders Movement.

The history of the Signs and Wonders Movement is complex and is fraught with doctrinal schisms. Some within this movement were solid men of God who were fairly sound in their doctrine, while we could genuinely question the very salvation of others. However, one thing underpins this entire movement. Undergirding each so-called waves of the Holy Spirit is a strong adherence to the mystical. Each wave sought special revelation from God apart from Scripture.